

Scottish Visual Art Demographics Report

Samar Ziadat for the Scottish Contemporary Art Network

August 2018

Contents

Introduction..... 1

Workforce Summary..... 1 - 12

i. Age (older / younger)..... 2

ii. Disability..... 2 - 3

iii. Gender..... 4

iv. Nationality / Cultural Identity..... 5

v. Pregnancy / Maternity / Carer Responsibilities..... 5

vi. Race Ethnicity..... 5 - 6

vii. Religion / Belief..... 6 - 7

viii. Sexual Orientation / Gender Reassignment..... 7 - 8

viii. Socio-economic Deprivation..... 8 - 12

Introduction

The purpose of this report is to summarise easily available data on the demographics of the Scottish visual art workforce and audiences, with a focus on protected characteristics (including socio-economic deprivation). This factual report will highlight the data available on these demographics, the gaps in information that we require to provide an accurate and representative overview of the sector's demographics, and the barriers which hinder marginalised communities' opportunities to access the Scottish visual arts. This report will form part of the Scottish Contemporary Art Network's internal equalities strategy.

Workforce Summary

According to Creative Scotland's, 'Understanding Diversity in the Arts Survey Summary Report' (2017), those employed in the arts, screen and creative industries are highly educated, with 71% of respondents holding degrees (across Scotland only 31% of the population is educated to degree level), there is a high concentration of women in many arts subsectors, and portfolio working is very common with respondents selecting an average of 2.5 other roles in addition to their main role¹. The survey that SCAN undertook on behalf of Creative Scotland for the Visual Arts Review revealed that the average total income of all respondents was £17,526. This drops to £14,933 for those who are self-employed, the majority of whom are artists. These figures are far below the median wage for Scotland, which was £26,427 in 2013/14 according to the Scottish Parliament Information Centre's Earnings in Scotland Report (2014)². The survey also revealed that below average incomes persist in the sector throughout career progression, with respondents who have 15 years or more experience reporting an average income of £20,930 per annum.

Cited in Creative Scotland's 2017 Report, The Scottish Government's 'Growth Sector Briefing' (2018) is one of the most conclusive documents on the creative and cultural workforce in Scotland³.

According to the briefing, employment in the creative industries stood at 84,000 in 2016, representing a 15.1% increase from 2015 (up 11,000 jobs), and in Scotland, this sector accounted for 3.2% of employment, while across Great Britain as a whole, it accounted for 5.1% of total employment. The 'Visual Arts', as defined by the briefing, accounted for 27,350 (29.4%) of jobs within the creative and cultural workforce in Scotland as of 2016. The briefing also indicates that creative industries were highly concentrated in specific areas of Scotland, with 26.5% (22,150) of

¹ Creative Scotland (2007). Understanding Diversity in the Arts Survey Summary Report. Retrieved from <https://sca-net.org/downloads/59bfe2faf21f3-artsanddiversitysurveysummary.pdf>

² Scottish Parliament Information Centre (2013). Earnings in Scotland Report. Retrieved from http://www.parliament.scot/ResearchBriefingsAndFactsheets/S4/SB_14-90_Earnings_in_Scotland_2014.pdf

³ Scottish Government (2018). Growth Sector Briefing – Creative Industries. Retrieved from <https://www.gov.scot/Topics/Statistics/Browse/Business/Publications/GrowthSectors/Briefings>

jobs located in Glasgow City, 19.2% (16,085) of jobs located in the City of Edinburgh and 5.4% (4,500) of jobs located in Aberdeen.

Despite being the most conclusive statistical data on the workforce in Scotland, this briefing is, for the purposes of this report, problematic in several aspects. Extracting data about the Scottish contemporary art workforce from this briefing would be contentious, as the briefing more widely maps employment in the creative and cultural industries in Scotland at large, including sectors such as Heritage and Press within their data. Not only is the statistical data too broad, but extracting data from the Visual Art breakdown of the briefing would also be inaccurate, as the definition of the Visual Art sector, according to the briefing, excludes art practices such as performance, and includes practices which arts professionals would not consider art-related jobs, such as newspaper publishing, TV production and the repair of furniture. In addition, many of the practices within the Visual Art category are not contemporary, such as the retail of antiques. Although the contemporary art sector does not lend itself to being easily quantified, the boundaries and definitions of the sector within this briefing are too indistinct for the data to produce accurate analysis.

Another factor which problematises the Scottish Government's briefing is freelance and contract based working which, to an extent, is very characteristic of the cultural economy. In Creative Scotland's Understanding Diversity in the Arts Survey Summary Report (2017), it is revealed that a significant proportion (41%) of their survey respondents were freelance workers and around a third work part time. In addition, 37% of respondents derive income from work outwith the sector, increasing to 54% among artists. Therefore, it could also be argued that the large number of freelance and occasional workers who are employed in the Scottish contemporary art sector are unlikely to be fully accounted for in official measures such as this Government briefing.

i. Age (older/younger)

In Creative Scotland's Understanding Diversity in the Arts Survey (2017), the age profile of respondents is largely similar to the Scottish working-age population with the exception of the 16-24 category which is under represented – perhaps explained by the high levels of education leading to later entry to the arts labour market. In total 47% of respondents cited age as a barrier. However, it was reported by young and old in different ways. Those in the youngest age group are most likely to see age as a barrier with comments such as being seen as too young for management and not being taken seriously. Whereas a frustration that opportunities are targeted only at the young with few opportunities for older people was cited by some older respondents

The mapping survey from Creative Scotland's 'Visual Arts Sector Review' (2016) revealed a broad age range of respondents with people under the age of 30 making up 16% of respondents and people in their forties making up 30%. Data from the Scottish Household Survey (2016) reveals that the visual

arts are most popular with the middle age groups and that there is significantly lower attendances at galleries, exhibitions and museums for the youngest (16-24) and oldest (75+) age groups⁴.

ii. Disability

The activities of the disability arts movement since the 1970s, the growing profile of the Paralympics movement, the existence of a particular strands of public funding and programmes from organisation like the Arts Council and the requirements on public organisations (since the Disability Discrimination Act 2005) to monitor the impacts of public policy on the disabled – all mean that question of inequality in terms of disability and culture may seem relatively well-covered compared to other categories that have been discussed in this report⁵. Creative Skillset, Creative Scotland, the Arts Council and the BFI provide data on disability in the sectors they cover. For example, we know that, as for women and ethnic minorities, the professional participation of disabled people in the cultural industries both starts from a lower base than for the population as a whole and gets worse the higher status the jobs in question. According to AHRC funded research, in England around 13% of the cultural workforce is classified as disabled, but Arts Council figures for example show that only 1.6 per cent of artistic staff, 2.8 per cent of managers and 3.9 per cent of Board members within larger cultural organisation and major museums consider themselves disabled⁶. In addition, Creative Scotland's 'Visual Arts Sector Review' (2016) tells us that a relatively large number of visual arts students in Scotland identified as disabled between 2011-2016 fluctuating between 15-23%.

In Creative Scotland's Understanding Diversity in the Arts Survey (2017), respondents were asked if they had a disability/long term health condition, with long term health conditions being defined as "conditions which have lasted, or are expected to last at least 12 months". Options could be chosen from a drop down list which included mental health condition; other long-term/chronic condition; learning disabilities; hearing impairment/Deaf; Physical disabilities; visual impairment; Developmental disorder; Other and prefer not to say" (listed in order of most commonly selected). 30% of respondents stated they had a disability/long term health condition, which is well above the national average of around 20%. However, 22% of the respondents stated their disability reduced their ability to carry out day-to-day activities 'a little' or 'a lot', which is closer in line with national level statistics. The most common condition, selected by 14% of all respondents is a mental health condition. 43% of disabled respondents stated that their disability was a barrier. This increased in line with the severity of their disability. Respondents who reported having a disability/long term

⁴ Scottish Government. Scottish Household Survey. Retrieved from <https://www.gov.scot/Resource/0052/00525088.pdf>

⁵ Arts and Humanities Research Council. Cultural Value and Inequality: A Critical Literature Review. Retrieved from <https://ahrc.ukri.org/documents/project-reports-and-reviews/cultural-value-and-inequality-a-critical-literature-review/>

⁶ Arts and Humanities Research Council. Cultural Value and Inequality: A Critical Literature Review. Retrieved from <https://ahrc.ukri.org/documents/project-reports-and-reviews/cultural-value-and-inequality-a-critical-literature-review/>

health conditions were more likely to earn less than the average for the sector. However, this does not take into account part time working.

Creative Scotland's 'Visual Arts Sector Review' (2016) cited instances in which improvements were made to access in the arts. The review stated that many visual arts organisations have benefitted from capital funding from Creative Scotland (and its predecessor the Scottish Arts Council) which placed a priority on access. This has contributed to the increased accessibility of gallery and studio space across Scotland. The SCAN survey reported that 58% of venue-based organisations offered full disabled access, 37% had partial disabled access and only 5% of respondents provided no disabled access. While there are some organisations supporting artists with a disability, including Project Ability, more could be done to support, promote and mainstream this work.

iii. Gender

According to Creative Scotland's 'Visual Arts Sector Review' (2016), there are a higher proportion of women than men working in the visual arts in Scotland. Data for this review was derived from a survey that SCAN undertook on behalf of Creative Scotland, which attracted 68% female respondents compared to only 29% male (>2% not specifying gender)⁷. In addition, the review also revealed that around two thirds of the staff from Creative Scotland's portfolio of Regularly Funded visual arts organisations are female (where gender was disclosed). Despite the high level of female participation within the Scottish workforce, female representation in senior leadership roles are significantly lower. Within the Creative Scotland's 2016 visual arts RFO portfolio, there were only 18 (58%) women and 13 men in leadership positions (eg Artistic Director/CEO). Similar findings were recorded in the Arts and Humanities Research Council's Cultural Value Project, 'Cultural Value and Inequality: A Critical Literature Review' (2015), less than 10 per cent of chairs of national arts organisations are women and even in the museums and gallery sector, where nearly 70 per cent of the workforce is female, only 28 per cent of directors of major galleries or museums are women.

Responses to the Visual Arts Review survey suggest that more women (68.3%) than men (29.4%) work in the visual arts in Scotland. This represents a bigger contrast to the UK visual arts workforce as a whole where females only represent 54% with males making up 46%⁸. According to the Review, despite women outnumbering men in the sector, men earn more money. Across all employment types men working in the visual arts earn 45% more (total median earnings) than their female counterparts. For those who spent more than 35 hours on their visual arts work, women were on average earning 56% less than men from their visual arts work. When asked about what aspects of the visual arts could work more effectively, nearly 350 responses were received from individuals and

⁷ Creative Scotland (2016). Visual Arts Sector Review. Retrieved from <https://sca-net.org/downloads/583586f42567a-visualartssectorreviewfinalreport.pdf>

⁸ Creative & Cultural Skills. Visual Arts Statistics 2012-13. Retrieved from <https://ccskills.org.uk/supporters/advice-research/article/the-creative-and-cultural-industries-visual-arts-2012-13>

organisations. For individual respondents one of the top three cited areas for development was fair pay.

Research by Arts Professional in 2015 found the gender pay gap in the arts was greater than the national average, with women earning up to £5k less than men at similar stages in their careers⁹. The average salary for men was found to be £32,500, compared with £28,500 for women – a gap that was slightly wider than the 9.4% British average at the time - despite women being better educated.

New Government legislation introduced in 2017 mandates any organisation based in England, Scotland or Wales with 250 or more employees must now publish and report specific figures about their gender pay gap¹⁰. These figures include disparity between men and women's average pay and bonuses, and must be published on their public-facing websites and reported to Government online. The 250 threshold applies to all permanent and contractual workers, including artists and other creatives, with the first published reports published by organisations in April 2018. Since the first reports have been revealed, it has been discovered that the average median gap reported across all organisations so far is 11.2%. Due to this legislation it has been revealed that at Arts Council England, women are underrepresented among staff receiving the highest pay at the national funder – holding 57% of such roles, despite making up 65% of the workforce. It was also reported that National Gallery had one of the largest pay gaps within the art sector, with women earning 15.2% less than men. This new legislation, especially if expanded to apply to all organisations (regardless of employee numbers), will provide invaluable statistical data on the gender pay gap within the Scottish contemporary art sector, and will allow for accurate comparison between the sector in Scotland and sectors in the rest of the UK.

iv. Nationality/Cultural Identity

Creative Scotland's Understanding Diversity in the Arts Survey Summary Report (2017), found that 8% of respondents are from the rest of the European Union. 87% of respondents identified being British/UK (either Scottish, British or English, Welsh or Northern Irish). 17% of white respondents stated their nationality was a barrier, with non-UK nationals more likely to cite this as a barrier (44%). 27% of English respondents cited this as a barrier, with some citing discrimination due to an English accent (12 respondents). Other comments included discrimination against foreign names and a number of non-EU respondents cited difficulties with securing work visas.

According to the Visual Arts Review, artists and the wider workforce are more likely to reside in the central belt, with half of respondents living in Glasgow (30%) or Edinburgh (20%). The next highest responses were Highlands, Dumfries and Galloway, Fife, the Scottish Borders and Aberdeenshire

⁹ Arts Professional (2015). Arts salary survey reveals stark gender pay gap. Retrieved from <https://www.artsprofessional.co.uk/news/arts-salary-survey-reveals-stark-gender-pay-gap>

¹⁰ British Government. Gender Pay Gap Reporting Overview. Retrieved from <https://www.gov.uk/guidance/gender-pay-gap-reporting-overview>

(each had between 4-5% of respondents). Organisations are spread across the country with the majority based in the central belt as well, with 29% in Glasgow and 19% in Edinburgh. The next highest identified were Highland (8%) and then Aberdeen, Dumfries and Galloway, Dundee and Fife (all 5%).

When respondents of the Visual Arts Review survey were asked about what aspects of the visual arts in Scotland could work more effectively, one of the top three cited areas for development was supporting activity and practice outwith of the central belt. For many, working outside of the central belt is isolating, especially in an industry where peer to peer working is so highly valued. When asked to indicate any priority or specific audiences besides the general public for their work, Peers/Other Artists/Arts Professionals were ranked highest. Local or geographic communities were next highly ranked followed by international audiences. Artists rate other artists as their most important connections closely followed by curators, gallerists and academics. Curators rate artists as their most important connections, closely followed by other curators, producers then gallerists. In addition, when individuals and organisations were asked about the most effective means for finding out what is happening in the sector and sharing good practice the most commonly cited by both groups were: online; informal peer to peer communication; attending gallery events programmes and private views; conferences and seminars and networks & membership organisations. Collaborative working is highly valued, with 56% of individuals stating that partnership working was very or extremely important while only 17% stated that it is of limited or no importance to their work. Furthermore, the majority of organisations felt that partnership or collaborative work is extremely or very important (39% and 23% of respondents respectively) to their work.

v. Pregnancy / Maternity / Carer Responsibilities

Creative Scotland's Understanding Diversity in the Arts Survey Summary Report (2017), found that parenting and carer responsibilities were a particular barrier for women. A third of survey respondents had parental or carer responsibilities with no significant variance by gender. However, there was significant gender variation in how responsibilities are shared, 57% of females described themselves as the primary or sole carer compared with only 9% of males; 44% of respondents felt that carer responsibilities were shared equally (although males were more likely to state this than females). Parental responsibilities are perceived as a far more significant barrier by women. 10% of all females (therefore approximately a third of women with children) cited parental responsibilities as a very significant barrier compared to only 3% of males (or roughly 10% of males with children). Respondents with children were more likely to cite economic limitations than those without, with 25% stating that economic limitations were a very significant barrier. The cost of childcare was the most commonly cited issue within the open comments, an issue which goes hand in hand with the low earnings which are characteristic of the sector. Many referenced the challenges of arranging childcare around the unpredictable, long and antisocial hours demanded by many careers within the sector. A growing issue within society is the care of our older people. Similar levels of males and

females had carer responsibilities for older/disabled adults (a total of 6%), however females were more likely to cite this as a barrier to career progression.

vi. Race/Ethnicity

According to Creative Scotland's Understanding Diversity in the Arts Survey Summary Report (2017), around 5% of all respondents stated they are from a minority ethnic or mixed group, which compares to 3.7% of the Scottish population¹¹. While Scotland has a smaller minority ethnic population than the UK as a whole, this is significantly below the general population figures, but consistent with other reports — for example, Creative and Cultural Skills reported that 5% of respondents to their UK-wide survey were from a minority ethnic background¹². Additionally, Creative Scotland's Visual Arts Sector Review (2016),¹³ found that from 2009 – 2014 (latest data) the amount of visual arts students from minority ethnic backgrounds in Scotland decreased from 7% to 4.4%, despite the general population figure more than doubling for those from minority ethnic backgrounds. It is also noted that there has been an increase in the number of students whose ethnicity is 'not known' (i.e. disclosure rates are decreasing).

In Creative Scotland's Understanding Diversity in the Arts Survey Summary Report (2017), half of visual Scottish arts workers in the minority ethnic or mixed groups stated their ethnicity was a barrier, with a quarter stating it is a significant or very significant barrier. Minority ethnic respondents also had a lower median income than average at £15,000. Comments included discrimination and cultural barriers within minority ethnic communities as well as a lack of interest or understanding of the cultural themes of artists work. According to Creative Scotland's 2016 Review, most minority ethnic employees in the arts are not in programme delivery and tend to be in support services. Within the visual arts RFOs there were no minority ethnic employees in senior leadership roles and only seven permanent members of staff from minority ethnic backgrounds.

vii. Religion / Belief

Data and research on the religion/belief of arts workers is difficult to find, however there is a relevant study that the Scottish Government undertook on the experiences of Muslims living in Scotland (2011)¹⁴. The research was carried out to understand more fully the experiences of Muslims living in Scotland both in response to the Scottish Government's wider commitment to equality for

¹¹ Scottish Government. Census 2011. Retrieved from <http://www.scotlandscensus.gov.uk/>

¹² Creative Skillset. 2012 Employment Census of the Creative Media Industries. Retrieved from http://creativeskillset.org/assets/0000/5070/2012_Employment_Census_of_the_Creative_Media_Industries.pdf

¹³ Creative Scotland. Visual Arts Sector Review 2016. Retrieved from <https://sca-net.org/downloads/583586f42567a-visualartssectorreviewfinalreport.pdf>

¹⁴ Scottish Government. Experiences of Muslims Living in Scotland (2011). Retrieved from <https://www.gov.scot/Resource/Doc/344206/0114485.pdf>

all people in Scotland, and the specific commitment set out in the Race Equality Statement. A picture emerged from the study that Muslim communities, both within Scotland and across Britain, report experiencing incidences of religious discrimination and racial discrimination, supporting arguments of a 'double burden'. I feel that this study is relevant, because of the low number of people of colour working in the arts in Scotland and in Britain more widely, and because of recent political events both in Britain and globally.

The study also highlighted that proportionately Muslims achieved lower educational attainment levels than other religious groups. Muslims were the most likely to have no qualifications between the ages of 16 and 29 of all religious groups, and the second most likely group to have no qualifications between the age of 30 and 49. Muslims in 2001 were among the least likely to have gained any qualifications, and the fourth lowest group to have gained a degree or professional qualification and this trend continues throughout each age group. Muslims in Scotland in 2001 were least likely to be economically active, with only 52% of Muslims of working age in employment or seeking employment. This low figure is likely to be a result of the low rates of economic activity for Muslim women as Muslim men were significantly more economically active than Muslim women, 67% and 35% respectively. Nevertheless, whilst this was the case, Muslim men had the lowest economic activity rate of all religious communities. Muslim women had the lowest level of economic activity by religion and 45% of Muslim women in Scotland have never worked, this is significantly higher than their male counterparts at 17%. According to the 2001 census, Muslims had the highest unemployment rate at 13% and Muslim women are more likely than women in any other religious group to be unemployed (15%). However, next to Sikhs, Muslims have the highest levels of self employment of all religious groups (29%) - over a third of Muslims (36%) in the 2001 Scottish census reported being employed in the wholesale and retail.

This report uses 2001 census data, as the 2011 census had not been published at the time, but it is still an interesting and insightful report – especially in its understandings of the intersections of race, gender and religious belief.

viii. Sexual Orientation/Gender Reassignment

These two categories should be assessed separately as sexual orientation and gender reassignment are two different issues – however, most surveys seem to place them together, asking if the respondent identifies as LGBT, which makes data on transgender and non-binary people difficult to discern.

In Creative Scotland's Understanding Diversity in the Arts Survey Summary Report (2017), 15% of respondents identified as being Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual or Transgendered (LGBT). This is considerably higher than the Scotland-wide estimate of 2.2%¹⁵. It is thought that this may indicate both a high

¹⁵ Scottish Government. Sexual Orientation Demographics (2016). Retrieved from <https://www.gov.scot/Topics/People/Equality/Equalities/DataGrid/SexualOrientation/SOrientPopMig>

representation of the LGBT community in the arts and an unusually high disclosure rate. While a high disclosure rate may indicate a high level of acceptance within the sector it is important to note that a quarter of respondents identifying as LGBT stated their sexual orientation was a barrier. However only 3% stated it was a significant barrier and none stated it was a very significant barrier.

Data on Transgender people in Britain is almost non-existent. LGBT in Britain: Trans Report (2018), a joint venture between Stonewall and YouGov, is the very first of its kind¹⁶. This report is not specific to the arts, but it is the most conclusive report we have, and it is an important one, as trans people are most likely from the LGBT+ community to face violence and discrimination. The survey, which Stonewall commissioned from YouGov, asked more than 5,000 lesbian, gay, bi and trans (LGBT) people across England, Scotland and Wales about their life in Britain today. This report, part of a series based on the research, investigates the specific experiences of the 871 trans and non-binary people who took part, across a range of areas of life in Britain. The study looks at the discrimination trans people face in their daily lives.

Some of the key findings which are relevant include:

Two in five trans people (41 per cent) and three in ten non-binary people (31 per cent) have experienced a hate crime or incident because of their gender identity in the last 12 months. One in eight trans employees (12 per cent) have been physically attacked by colleagues or customers in the last year. Half of trans and non-binary people (51 per cent and 50 per cent respectively) have hidden or disguised the fact that they are LGBT at work because they were afraid of discrimination. More than a third of trans university students (36 per cent) in higher education have experienced negative comments or behaviour from staff in the last year. The report's recommendations for employers include:

Develop clear zero tolerance policies on transphobic bullying, discrimination and harassment policies, supported by all-staff training. Using Stonewall's guidance, develop a policy to support trans employees who are transitioning, including information on confidentiality, dress codes and using facilities, with related guidance for line managers. Join more than 760 employers on Stonewall's Diversity Champions programme, the UK's leading best practice forum for employers on LGBT inclusion. Visit www.stonewall.org.uk/diversity-championsprogramme to join the programme.

ix. Socio-economic deprivation

One of the largest gaps in public data relates to social class and its intersection with ethnicity and spatial inequality, and the obvious link it has to the problem of unpaid work in the art world.

The 2010 Equality Act defines nine 'protected' characteristics (age, race, gender reassignment, disability, marital status, pregnancy and maternity, religious belief, gender and sexual orientation),

¹⁶ Stonewall. LGBT in Britain: Trans Report (2018). Retrieved from <https://www.stonewallscotland.org.uk/sites/default/files/lgbt-in-britain-trans.pdf>

but despite some suggestions at the time it was drafted, it does not include social class¹⁷. As a result, public organisations are not required to collect data on social class and thus the debate about class discrimination has to be carried out against a background of absent or less than comprehensive data. A variety of proxies – private school education is currently a popular one – can be used, but because this only covers 7% of the UK population exclusive concentration on this factor ignores other social class issues¹⁸. Other organisations use higher education qualifications as a proxy, particularly where individuals are the first generation of their family to attend University, which seems a more robust indicator. Postcode data, correlated with other statistics on poverty, is also used, though this is less reliable in cities where wealth and poverty can exist quite close to one another.

We know from British Government statistics that more than half (57.7 per cent) of jobs in the Creative Economy were filled by people who have a degree or equivalent qualification in 2013, compared to 31.1 per cent of all jobs in the UK, so this provides us with some indication of the class profile of the creative workforce, but this is not robust data and it is not visual art focused or Scotland-centric¹⁹. Similar findings can be found in Creative Scotland’s Visual Arts Sector Review (2016), which stressed the important role that formal education plays within the visual arts sector in Scotland. According to the Review, around 6000 students are studying visual arts subjects at Scotland’s colleges and universities each year. The SCAN mapping survey, which is also part of the Review, reveals a highly qualified sector with only 5% of respondents stating they had no formal arts education or specialist training and 31% holding a postgraduate qualification in fine art. Higher and Further Education Scotland also has eight universities offering visual arts courses (including art history) which collectively had over 2000 students in 2013/14.

As mentioned earlier, Creative Scotland’s Understanding Diversity in the Arts Survey Summary Report (2017) found that 71% of arts workers in Scotland are degree educated, with only 4% stating that they did not undertake any further or higher education. Across Scotland only 31% of the population is educated to degree level. In addition, freelance and contract based working, which is, arguably, characteristic of the cultural economy, highlights the fragility and insecurity of working practices within the sector and the specific challenges that this presents. In the report, it is stated that it is not possible to fully infer if working arrangements are an indicator of choice or necessity,

¹⁷ British Government. 2010 Equality Act. Retrieved from <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2010/15/contents>

¹⁸ Arts and Humanities Research Council. Cultural Value and Inequality: A Critical Literature Review. Retrieved from <https://ahrc.ukri.org/documents/project-reports-and-reviews/cultural-value-and-inequality-a-critical-literature-review/>

¹⁹ British Government, Department of Digital, Culture, Media and Sport. Creative Industries Economic Estimates – January 2014. Retrieved from <https://www.gov.uk/government/statistics/creative-industries-economic-estimates-january-2014>

however, many respondents in the open comments described the necessity of taking on additional work to support their artistic practice and concerns around job insecurity.

In the same Creative Scotland report, the survey found that the median income was just £20,000, and those who describe themselves as primarily artists/performers (60%) earned less than £20,000 per annum. In addition, there is no significant relationship between income and age or years worked in the sector which indicates that income tends not to increase with additional experience gained. While average income increases as hours worked increases, there is not a direct relationship and the data suggests those working in excess of 40 hours per week are on a far lower hourly rate. This may be symptomatic of the large number of freelance workers in the sector and the project based payment structures for many creative jobs. 'Economic limitations' was the most commonly cited barrier of the survey, selected by 76% of all respondents. 'Economic limitations' was more commonly cited by women, part time workers and by those who were primarily artists (86%). Those in receipt of benefits, disabled people or with childcare responsibilities were most likely to cite economic limitations as a very significant barrier. The same question on barriers also included the option of 'poverty' which was selected by 35% of respondents. In this context, poverty is a subjective and emotive term however the very low incomes reported by many respondents support the assertion that socio-economic factors are an issue for a significant portion of the sector.

This same report collected data on creative workers' assets in another attempt to measure the sectors' class demographics. The report found that although income within the sector is well below the national average, workers in the sector are arguably asset rich. Respondents are highly educated, have comparatively high levels of home ownership, and a higher than average number of people were privately educated (14% compared with 4% in Scotland as a whole). In addition, nearly half received financial support from family or friends to support their professional career in the arts.

One of the most common issues relating to class within this report included the sector's expectation for its employees to work for free. The results indicate that 52% of respondents had undertaken some kind of apprenticeship, internship or workplace training and while the majority were paid placements, around one third of all reported work-based training initiatives (work placements, internships or apprenticeships/traineeships) were unpaid. 20% of all respondents had undertaken unpaid placements, which were far more prevalent among the younger age groups, which suggests that unpaid work may be a more recent demand of the sector.

Similar results were summarised in Creative Scotland's Visual Arts Sector Review (2016), which stated that 68% of work placements/internships/traineeships/apprenticeships opportunities were voluntary or unpaid, and less than half of the respondent arts organisations recorded employing people through placements, apprenticeships, traineeships and internships. The Review also highlighted the value of public funding in enabling people to maintain their creative and professional development, to undertake artistic research, to deliver independent curatorial or artist-run initiatives and to produce new work. However, the majority of artists and other professionals in the

sector are self-funding their practice. Of the respondents to the survey 40% had not applied for public funding in the last five years and just under a fifth (19%) had applied only once for funding during this period. 29% of survey respondents who had applied for funding reported being unsuccessful in all of their applications while only 24% reported being successful in all of their applications.

As a part of this Review, SCAN's Mapping the Visual Arts Survey (2015) collected data on volunteers working within the sector. 45 organisations provided an estimate of how many hours were contributed by volunteers to their work in the preceding financial year. The sum total was 49,572, averaging 1,102 hours per organisation. The numbers of volunteers reported by these 45 organisations totalled 1,635, meaning that it is possible to calculate the average contribution per volunteer as 30 hours over the year. There are some notable variations in the dataset where a small number of volunteers have made a far larger contribution, for example, organisations whose staff and board are unpaid, six volunteers contributing 2600 hours during the year to an arts centre, five people contributing 2600 hours to an artist-led space, nine volunteers providing 2500 hours to another artist-led space, led by an unpaid committee and with no employed staff, and festivals (including one where 70 volunteers contributed a total of 2800 hours of work).

Lack of connections was the second most commonly cited barrier (68%) in Creative Scotland's Understanding Diversity in the Arts Survey Summary Report (2017), with artists even more likely to cite it as a barrier (81%). This supports other research indicating that the sector is heavily dependent on informal networks, and social and cultural capital. Comments on this theme included statements about the sector being insular, that connections are more important in Scotland as a small nation, and there were frustrations with jobs not being advertised openly.

'Panic! Social Class, Taste and Inequalities in the Creative Industries', led by sociologists from the Universities of Edinburgh and Sheffield, is an AHRC funded project which investigates class inequalities in the cultural workforce²⁰. The project seeks to quantify class in a manner unprecedented in the arts until now. The resulting report argues that even though it is complicated and contested, class is an important way of thinking about overall social inequality. It also stressed the importance of not seeing class isolation, as it intersects with protected characteristics, such as race and gender. The report uses several proxies to draw together information about people's starting points in life as well as their current social position (also described as 'origins' and 'destinations'). 'Origins' are supposed to tell us the classes people have come from, as opposed to the class of the jobs they do now. This is useful as almost all of the occupations in the creative industries are middle class destinations, yet the people doing those creative jobs might come from a range of different class origins.

²⁰ Arts and Humanities Research Council. Panic! Social Class, Taste and Inequalities in the Creative Industries. Retrieved from <http://createlondon.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/04/Panic-Social-Class-Taste-and-Inequalities-in-the-Creative-Industries1.pdf>

The report used data from the Office for National Statistics' Labour Force Survey (LFS) to understand class origins, and found people of working class origin to be underrepresented in specific cultural and creative jobs – fewer than 13% in both publishing and the film and TV industries, and only marginally better in the arts, at 18%²¹. This is in stark contrast to the 35% of people of working class origins in the workforce overall, according to LFS data. Using this data was central to the project, as the LFS survey provides data on several proxies, asking questions, for example, about a parent, guardian, or caregiver's occupation when an individual was growing up. More specifically, asking who respondents were living with when they were 14 years old; who the main wage earner was at that time; and what their main job was. This information is used to place individuals on a 'map' of occupations called the National Statistics Socio-Economic Classification (NS-SEC). NS-SEC clusters occupations together into eight groups, which were adapted and expanded by the Panic project.

These proxies suggest lots of different questions including, but not limited to, parental income, parental education, the type of school an individual attended, living in an area of deprivation, or being in receipt of free school meals at school. It provides a well-supported and robust starting point for understanding the class origins of creative workers. Additionally, it removes the issue of self-identification, which various forms of research have shown leads people to misidentify their class position and often their class privileges. This approach also means organisations can benchmark against the broad trends identified in national data; allows them to ask more fundamental questions about social class and how it intersects with protected characteristics found in – or missing from – their workforce.

Although data analysis in this report groundbreaking for the arts sector, these measures do have limitations. For example, it may be difficult for an individual to answer how much money their parents or guardians earned when they were growing up; and 'growing up in a deprived area' could be misleading, given that affluent individuals may grow up in deprived areas, but the areas classified as "deprived" have changed over time.

²¹ Office for National Statistics. Labour Force Survey (LFS). Retrieved from <https://www.ons.gov.uk/surveys/informationforhouseholdsandindividuals/householdsandindividualsurveys/labourforcesurveylfs>